

**TO:** Planning Commission  
**FROM:** Ben Boike, Assistant Comm. Dev. Dir.  
**DATE:** September 20, 2016  
**SUBJECT:** Site Plan/CUP Review – 5 Wentworth Ave E.



---

**REQUEST**

On behalf of the Harrison Family Trust, Mularoni & Co. is requesting the following zoning applications in order to expand the existing building and modify the parking lot at 5 Wentworth Ave E.:

- 1) Site Plan approval for the building addition and parking lot modification
- 2) Conditional Use Permit to allow a Dental Clinic (lab) in a B1 District.

***Attachments:***

*Applications/ Notice*

*Memos from the Environment Committee, the Civil Engineer, and the Fire Marshal*  
*Copies of submitted plans*



**EXISTING LAND USES**

The subject property consists of a dental lab. Adjacent properties to the north, east and south are occupied by office uses. Adjacent properties to the south are occupied by single-family homes.

## **ZONING**

The subject property is zoned B1, Limited Business. Adjacent properties to the north and east are zoned B3, General Business. Adjacent properties to the south are zoned B6, Town Center Mixed Use. Adjacent properties to the west are zoned R1, Single Family.

## **SITE PLAN ANALYSIS**

### **Proposal**

The applicant is proposing a one-story 4,262 sq. ft. walkout addition to the north side of their existing building. In addition, the applicant is also proposing to modify the existing parking lot by separating the “upper lot” (west parking lot) with the “lower lot” (north parking lot). The family run business has been in operation at this location since 1976. The proposed building expansion is needed to expand their operation.

### **Building Materials**

Section 153.032(F)(1) of the Zoning Ordinance requires that exterior building materials be comprised of a minimum of 60 percent primary materials (brick, stone, stucco, or glass). Secondary materials which includes decorative block, synthetic stucco, wood and metal, may only account for 40 percent of the façade.

The applicant is proposing a combination of stucco (primary), glass (primary), and decorative block (secondary) to match the existing building. The submitted plans call for prefinished metal on the east and west elevations which are not primary materials however the applicant confirmed that the labels are error and that the planned material is stucco. Staff is recommending a condition of approval requiring that the elevations be revised accordingly. The proposed stucco and glass account for more than 60 percent of the façade. Therefore, the proposed building materials meet code.

### **Window Coverage**

Section 153.032(F)(3) requires 40 percent window coverage for all facades facing a street, parking lot, or open space.

The proposed addition meets the window coverage requirement.

### **Visual Relief**

Section 153.032(F)(4) requires that all exterior elevations adjacent to a street, parking lot or open space must not exceed 60 feet in length without visual relief of two or more of the following:

The three elevations do not require visual relief as they do not exceed 60 feet in length.

### **Rooftop Mechanicals**

The proposed plans do not address whether or not rooftop mechanicals for the addition will be properly screened as required by the Zoning Ordinance. Staff recommends a condition of approval requiring that all rooftop mechanicals be screened per Section 153.032(F)(5).

**Building Setbacks**

The proposed building addition meets all setback requirements.

**Parking Setbacks**

The modified parking lot meets all required setback requirements.

**Access**

The applicant is not proposing any modifications to the two existing access points to Humboldt Ave. However the applicant is proposing a parking lot connection from the subject property to the property to the east at the northeast corner of the property. The property owner has worked out a parking agreement with the neighboring property to allow overflow parking in the parking lot to the east. The proposed driveway connection will allow for employees/visitors the ability to enter the neighboring parking lot directly from the parking lot on the subject property.

**Parking Requirements**

The proposed parking modifications result in the same number of parking stalls as existing, 36. The Zoning Ordinance requires a total number of 41 parking stalls. However, as mentioned, the property owner has entered into a parking agreement with the neighboring property owner to the east to allow for 13 overflow parking stalls.

**Drive Aisles/Parking Stall Dimensions**

The submitted plans do not indicate whether or not the existing/modified drive aisles and parking stalls meet minimum dimension requirements. Staff is recommending a condition of approval requiring the applicant to revise the site plan to include and meet all drive aisle and parking stall dimensions.

**Curbing**

The proposed parking lot addition includes B612 curbing as required by the Zoning Ordinance.

**Trash Enclosure**

The applicant is proposing to relocate the existing trash enclosure to the south in order to allow for the proposed parking lot connection the neighboring property to the east. Staff is recommending a condition of approval requiring the applicant to provide elevations of the proposed enclosure and that the proposed enclosure meets the provisions as outlined in Section 153.032(F)(6).

**Lighting**

No new lighting is proposed for the property.

**Landscaping**

Based on the exterior linear feet of the newly created property, code requires a total of 40 trees on-site (1 tree per 20 lineal ft. of property). The existing property has total of 15 trees on-site that will remain. The applicant is proposing a total of 9 new quality trees (7 deciduous trees and 2 coniferous trees). Staff is comfortable with the proposed landscaping despite the reduction in required trees. Staff believes that the proposed plan distributes trees appropriately in areas where they can be located plus the applicant is proposing a total of 44 additional shrubs for the site.

Staff did receive an email from a neighboring property owner inquiring as to whether or not the proposed trees along Humboldt Ave could be coniferous trees rather than deciduous trees as they would provide better screening of the parking lot. Staff is recommending the four most northern deciduous trees adjacent to Humboldt be replaced with acceptable coniferous trees as allowed by code.

### **Irrigation**

The existing property has an irrigation system. No modifications are proposed.

### **Environmental Committee**

The Environmental Committee reviewed the submitted landscape plan at their September 7, 2016 meeting. The Committee liked the overall plan and liked that many existing trees would remain. They agreed with the Assistant Community Development Director's recommendations, but noted that instead of adding additional trees, that they should consider planting larger diameter trees such as 3-4 inch instead of 2½ inch. The Committee unanimously voted to approve the site plan, with an additional comment that they strongly encourage the developer to use "pollinator friendly" native plants that were not treated with "neonicotinoids".

### **Engineer's Recommendation**

The City Engineer has provided a memo with three (3) recommended conditions pertaining to the Site Plan (see attached memo). Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the applicant adhere to the recommendations in the memo. The conditions are as follows:

1. Permits from the appropriate regulatory agencies must be obtained, including but not limited to the MPCA, Dakota County, MnDOT, etc.
2. An existing curb cut is the same location as the proposed trash enclosure. The existing curb cut was the primary drainage flume for half of the lower parking lot. Indicate on the proposed plan where the new curb cut will be located.
3. Include a typical cross-section indicating the proposed pavement section through the proposed parking lot connection.

### **Fire Marshal Recommendation**

The Fire Marshal has provided a memo with two (2) recommended conditions pertaining to the site plan (see attached memo). Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the applicant adhere to the recommendations in the memo. The conditions are as follows:

1. Per Minnesota State Building Code 1306 – Entire building shall be protected by an Automatic Sprinkler System.
2. The City of West St. Paul has adopted Minnesota State Building Code Chapter 1306 Subp. 2. Automatic sprinkler systems for buildings increased in total floor area must be installed and maintained in operational condition within the structure. The new addition and the existing building will require an automatic sprinkler system.

## **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT ANALYSIS**

### **Zoning Code**

The Zoning Code requires a Conditional Use Permits for all Dental Clinics or Labs

### **Analysis**

Since the existing Use predates the Zoning Ordinance requirement of a Conditional Use Permit, the Site Plan approval triggers the need for the property owner to obtain a Conditional use Permit in order to bring the Use into compliance with the current Zoning Ordinance.

### **Business Overview**

As mentioned, the family run business began in 1976. The company manufactures dental prosthesis on-site in their dental lab. As business continues to grow, the owners need additional lab space to expand their operation. The company currently has 30 employees.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

**Staff recommends APPROVAL of the SITE PLAN for the expansion of the existing building and modifications to the existing parking lot subject to the submitted site plan and to the following conditions:**

1. Council approval of the corresponding Conditional Use Permit application.
2. The applicant shall obtain all applicable building and sign permits for the approved site improvements.
3. Upon application of a building permit, the applicant shall:
  - a. Revise the east and west building elevations by relabeling the “prefinished metal” building material with “stucco” in order to meet the exterior building materials requirement.
  - b. Revise the site plan to include all drive aisle and parking stall dimensions. All drive aisles and parking stalls shall meet the minimum requirements as outlined in Section 153.347 of the Zoning Ordinance.
  - c. Provide elevations of the proposed enclosure and that the proposed enclosure meets the provisions as outlined in Section 153.032(F)(6).
  - d. Revise the plans to replace the northernmost four deciduous trees with acceptable coniferous trees.
4. All rooftop mechanicals shall be screened per Section 153.032(F)(5).
5. The applicant shall adhere to the recommendations outlined in the attached memos provided by the City Civil Engineer, the Environmental Committee, and the Fire Marshal.

**Staff recommends APPROVAL of the CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT to allow a Dental Office (Lab) in a B1 District at 5 Wentworth Ave E. subject to the following conditions:**

1. Council approval of the corresponding Site Plan application.